

Confidential Attachment for Contract EOI6105 7108 Benton Road, Elamo Road, Nagoondie Lane, Healesville - Road Improvement Works Special Charge Scheme

This confidential attachment remains confidential indefinitely as it relates to matters specified under section 3(1)(g)(i)(g)(ii) of the Local Government Act 2020.

At its meeting on 24 September 2019 Council endorsed a list of roads to be constructed using this funding to be facilitated by means of Special Charge Schemes.

Benton Road, Elamo Road, and Nagoondie Lane, Healesville were included on this list of roads and in accordance with Council's Special Charge Scheme Policy, landowner support has been sought and obtained for construction of the road. The project has been listed in Council's 2022/23 Capital Expenditure Program.

Quotations Received

No	Name	Address	Price (ex. GST & inc. Provisional Items)
1	Bells Civil Excavations Pty Ltd	170 Yarraview Road, Yarra Glen VIC 3775	\$1,221,329.00
2	Etheredge Mintern Pty Ltd	25 Kelvin Road, Bayswater VIC 3153	\$916,120.00
3	JTX Civil Contracting Pty Ltd t/as Jotomex Civil Contracting	18 Winyard Drive, Mooroolbark VIC 3138	\$1,048,397.95
4	Parkinson Group Pty Ltd	30 Alfred Street, Blackburn VIC 3130	\$1,393,193.50
5	TDM Earthworks Pty Ltd	273a Monbulk Road, Silvan VIC 3795	\$1,393,366.80

Quotation Evaluation

Evaluation Panel Members:

Client Representative	Joseph Sanchez Project Engineer
	Dennis Ward Senior Project Construction Engineer
	Danny Leonard Project Engineer
Procurement Services Representative	Vimi D'Mello Procurement Officer

Quotation Conformance

Quotes were assessed for conformity with the quotation documents and all quotes were conforming.

The Evaluation Panel scored quotations against the criteria using pre-established weightings as published in the request for quote response schedule.

Further clarifications were sought from two shortlisted tenders, Etheredge Mintern and Jotomex Civil Contracting regarding Traffic Management and adjustment of sewer pit levels. Etheredge Mintern was also requested to clarify a couple of price line items and to provide a specific start date.

Both Etheredge Mintern and Jotomex Civil Contracting presented reasoning on their pricing for Traffic Management and adjustment of sewer pit levels. Etheredge Mintern provided an updated schedule of prices document to reflect the changes on a couple of price line items. This clarification resulted in Etheredge Mintern's submitted price becoming lower. Lastly, Etheredge Mintern confirmed that regardless of their start date (December or January) they are still able to achieve the required practical completion date of 30 June 2023.

The Evaluation Panel were satisfied with the clarifications. The final price and rankings against the evaluation criteria are as per the table below.

Tenderers with the highest percentage score are considered to present the Best Value Outcome.

Selection Criteria	Weighting	Average Score Bells Civil Excavations Pty Ltd	Average Score Etheredge Mintern Pty Ltd	Average Score Jotomex Civil Contracting	Average Score Parkinson Group Pty Ltd	Average Score TDM Earthworks Pty Ltd
Final Price (ex. GST & inc. Provisional Items)		\$1,221,329.00	\$916,120.00	\$1,048,397.95	\$1,393,193.50	\$1,393,366.80
Price	85%	63.8%	85.0%	74.3%	55.9%	55.9%
Timeframes	15%	12.0%	7.0%	12.0%	0.0%	9.0%
TOTAL	100%	75.8%	92.0%	86.3%	55.9%	64.9%
Ranking		3	1	2	5	4

Budget Details

Source	Financial Year	Amount (ex. GST)
Landowner Contribution as part of Special Charge Scheme	Repayments begin in the 2023/24 Financial Year	\$416,500
Council funding via Federal Government Grant	2022/23	\$852,422
Benton Road, Elamo Road, and Nagoondie Lane, Healesville Declaration of Special Charge Scheme	Initial Estimated Total Project Budget	\$1,268,922
Less Project Development costs		
Scheme preparation, supervision, administration etc.		(\$55,170.50)
Engineering Consultants		(\$55,170.50)
Tree Management (Arborist assessment, Tree offsets)		(\$55,170.50)
Initial Available Construction Budget		\$1,103,410.50

A summary of the recommended Tenderer follows:

Etheredge Mintern Pty Ltd

- Etheredge Mintern Pty Ltd have submitted the most competitive quotation and best value for money option.
- Have successfully completed various civil construction contracts for council previously to agreed standard.
- According to internal reference checks, complete quality projects, on time and within budget and do not seek frequent or excessive variation claims.